SCC Court File No: 40061

# IN THE SUPREME COURT OF CANADA

(ON APPEAL FROM THE COURT OF APPEAL OF QUÉBEC)

IN THE MATTER OF a Reference to the Court of Appeal of Québec in relation to the *Act respecting First Nations, Inuit and Métis children, youth and families* (Order in Council No.: 1288-2019)

# **BETWEEN:**

# ATTORNEY GENERAL OF QUÉBEC

APPELLANT

-and-

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF CANADA, ASSEMBLÉE DES PREMIÈRES NATIONS QUÉBEC-LABRADOR (APNQL), COMMISSION DE LA SANTÉ ET DES SERVICES SOCIAUX DES PREMIÈRES NATIONS DU QUÉBEC ET DU LABRADOR (CSSSPNQL), SOCIÉTÉ MAKIVIK, ASSEMBLÉE DES PREMIÈRES NATIONS ASENIWUCHE WINEWAK NATION OF CANADA, SOCIÉTÉ DE SOUTIEN À L'ENFANCE ET À LA FAMILLE DES PREMIÈRES NATIONS DU CANADA

**RESPONDENTS** 

-and-

# ATTORNEY GENERAL OF MANITOBA, ATTORNEY GENERAL OF BRITISH COLUMBIA, ATTORNEY GENERAL OF ALBERTA, ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE NORTHWEST TERRITORIES

**INTERVENERS** 

[Style of cause continued on next page]

# FACTUM OF THE INTERVENER, TRIBAL CHIEFS VENTURES INC.

(Pursuant to Rules 42 of the Rules of the Supreme Court of Canada)

**GOWLING WLG (CANADA) LLP** 

Suite 2300, Bentall 5 550 Burrard Street Vancouver, BC V6C 2B5

**Aaron Christoff Brent Murphy** 

Tel: (604) 443-7685 Fax: (604) 683-3558

Email: aaron.christoff@gowlingwlg.com

GOWLING WLG (CANADA) LLP

160 Elgin Street Suite 2600

Ottawa K1P 1C3

**Marie-Christine Gagnon** 

Tel.: (613) 786-0086 Fax: (613) 7563-9869

Email:

Marie-christine.Gagnon@ca.gowlingwlg.com

Counsel for the Intervener, Tribal Chiefs

Ventures Inc.

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Intervener, Tribal Chiefs Ventures Inc.

# AND BETWEEN:

# ATTORNEY GENERAL OF CANADA

**APPELLANT** 

-and-

# ATTORNEY GENERAL OF QUÉBEC

RESPONDENT

-and-

GRAND COUNCIL OF TREATY #3, INNU TAKUAIKAN UASHAT MAK MANI-UTENAM (ITUM), AGISSANT COMME BANDE TRADITIONNELLE ET AU NOM DES INNUS DE UASHAT MAK MANI-UTENAM, FEDERATION OF SOVEREIGN INDIGENOUS NATIONS, PEGUIS CHILD AND FAMILY SERVICES, NATIVE WOMEN'S ASSOCIATION OF CANADA, COUNCIL OF YUKON FIRST NATIONS, INDIGENOUS BAR ASSOCIATION, CHIEFS OF ONTARIO, INUVIALUIT REGIONAL CORPORATION, INUIT TAPIRIIT KANATAMI, NUNATSIAVUT GOVERNMENT AND NUNAVUT TUNNGAVIK INCORPORATED, NUNATUKAVUT COMMUNITY COUNCIL, LANDS ADVISORY BOARD, MÉTIS NATIONAL COUNCIL, MÉTIS NATION-SASKATCHEWAN, MÉTIS NATION OF ALBERTA, MÉTIS NATION BRITISH COLUMBIA, MÉTIS NATION OF ONTARIO AND LES FEMMES MICHIF OTIPEMISIWAK, LISTUGUJ MI'GMAO GOVERNMENT. CONGRESS OF ABORIGINAL PEOPLES, FIRST NATIONS FAMILY ADVOCATE OFFICE, ASSEMBLY OF MANITOBA CHIEFS, FIRST NATIONS OF THE MAA-NULTH TREATY SOCIETY, TRIBAL CHIEFS VENTURES INC., UNION OF BRITISH COLUMBIA INDIAN CHIEFS, FIRST NATIONS SUMMIT OF BRITISH COLUMBIA AND BRITISH COLUMBIA ASSEMBLY OF FIRST NATIONS, DAVID ASPER CENTRE FOR CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS, REGROUPEMENT PETAPAN, CANADIAN CONSTITUTION FOUNDATION, CARRIER SEKANI FAMILY SERVICES SOCIETY, CHESLATTA CARRIER NATION, NADLEH WHUTEN, SAIK'UZ FIRST NATION AND STELLAT'EN FIRST NATION, CONSEIL DES ATIKAMEKW D'OPITCIWAN, VANCOUVER ABORIGINAL CHILD AND FAMILY SERVICES SOCIETY, NISHNAWBE ASKI NATION, ATTORNEY GENERAL OF MANITOBA, ATTORNEY GENERAL OF BRITISH COLUMBIA, ATTORNEY GENERAL OF ALBERTA, ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE NORTHWEST **TERRITORIES** 

**INTERVENERS** 

TO: THE REGISTRAR

AND TO:

BERNARD, ROY & ASSOCIÈS

1, rue Notre-Dame Est, bureau 8.00

Montréal, QC H2Y 1B6

**Samuel Chayer Francis Demers** 

Tel: (514) 393-2336 Ext: 51456

Fax: (514) 873-7074

Email: samuel.chayer@justice.gouv.qc.ca

Counsel for the Appellant/Respondent,

Attorney General of Québec

MINISTÈRE DE LA JUSTICE - CANADA

284, rue Wellington Ottawa, ON K1A 0H8

Bernard Letarte François Joyal

Tel: (613) 946-2776 Fax: (613) 952-6006

Email: bernard.letarte@justice.gc.ca

Counsel for the Respondent/Appellant,

Attorney General of Canada

FRANKLIN GERTLER ÉTUDE LÉGALE

507 Place d'Armes, bureau 1701

Montréal, QC H2Y 2W8

Franklin S. Gertler Gabrielle Champigny Hadrien Gabriel Burlone Mira Levasseur Moreau

Tel: (514) 798-1988 Fax: (514) 798-1986

Email: franklin@gertlerlex.ca

Counsel for the Respondents / Interveners, Assemblée des Premières Nations Québec-Labrador (APNQL) & Commission de la santé NOËL ET ASSOCIÈS, s.e.n.c.r.l.

225, montée Paiement, 2e étage

Gatineau, QC J8P 6M7

Pierre Landry

Tel: (819) 503-2178 Fax: (819) 771-5397

Email: p.landry@noelassocies.com

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the

Appellant/Respondent, Attorney General of

Québec

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF CANADA

Department of Justice Canada, Civil Litigation Section 50 O'Connor Street, 5th Floor

Ottawa, ON K1A 0H8

Christopher M. Rupar

Tel: (613) 670-6290 Fax: (613) 954-1920

Email: christopher.rupar@justice.gc.ca

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the

Respondent/Appellant, Attorney General of

Canada

SUPREME ADVOCACY LLP

100- 340 Gilmour Street Ottawa, ON K2P 0R3

**Marie-France Major** 

Tel: (613) 695-8855 Ext: 102

Fax: (613) 695-8580

Email: mfmajor@supremeadvocacy.ca

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Respondent / Interveners, Assemblée des Premières Nations Québec-Labrador (APNQL) & Commission de la santé et des services sociaux des Premières

et des services sociaux des Premières Nations du Québec et du Labrador (CSSSPNQL)

LARIVIÈRE DORVAL PALARDY CAMPBELL TUCKER

1111, boul. Dr.-Frederik-Philips Montréal, QC H4M 2X6

Kathryn Tucker Robin Campbell

Tel: (514) 745-8880 Fax: (514) 745-3700 Email: ktucker@makivik.org

Counsel for the Respondent / Intervener, Société Makivik

ASSEMBLY OF FIRST NATIONS

55 Metcalfe Street, Suite 1600 Ottawa, ON K1P 6L5

Stuart Wuttke Julie McGregor Adam Williamson

Tel: (613) 241-6789 Ext: 228

Fax: (613) 241-5808 Email: <u>swuttke@afn.ca</u>

Counsel for the Respondent / Intervener, Assemblée des Premières Nations

JFK LAW CORPORATION

1175 Douglas St., Suite 816 Victoria, BC V8W 2E1

**Claire Truesdale** 

Tel: (250) 405-3467 Fax: (250) 381-8567

Email: ctruesdale@jfklaw.ca

Counsel for the Respondent / Intervener, Aseniwuche Winewak Nation of Canada

Société de soutien à l'enfance et à la famille des Premières Nations du Canada

Nations du Québec et du Labrador (CSSSPNQL)

SUPREME ADVOCACY LLP

100- 340 Gilmour Street Ottawa, ON K2P 0R3

**Marie-France Major** 

Tel: (613) 695-8855 Ext: 102

Fax: (613) 695-8580

Email: mfmajor@supremeadvocacy.ca

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Respondent /

Intervener, Société Makivik

SUPREME LAW GROUP

1800 - 275 Slater Street Ottawa, ON K1P 5H9

**Moira Dillon** 

Tel: (613) 691-1224 Fax: (613) 691-1338

Email: mdillon@supremelawgroup.ca

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Respondent / Intervener, Assemblée des Premières Nations

SUPREME ADVOCACY LLP

100- 340 Gilmour Street Ottawa, ON K2P 0R3

**Marie-France Major** 

Tel: (613) 695-8855 Ext: 102

Fax: (613) 695-8580

Email: mfmajor@supremeadvocacy.ca

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Respondent / Intervener, Aseniwuche Winewak Nation of

Canada

# **CONWAY BAXTER WILSON LLP**

411 Roosevelt Avenue, suite 400 Ottawa, ON K2A 3X9

David P. Taylor Naiomi W. Metallic Tel: (613) 691-0368

FAX: (613) 688-0271

Email: dtaylor@conwaylitigation.ca

Counsel for the Respondent / Intervener, Société de soutien à l'enfance et à la famille des Premières Nations du Canada

#### ATTORNEY GENERAL OF MANITOBA

Constitutional Law 1230 - 405 Broadway Winnipeg, MB R3C 3L6

# Heather S. Leonoff, K.C. Kathryn Hart

Tel: (204) 391-0717 Fax: (204) 945-0053

Email: heather.leonoff@gov.mb.ca

kathryn.hart@gov.mb.ca

Counsel for the Intervener, Attorney General of Manitoba

# ATTORNEY GENERAL OF BRITISH COLUMBIA

PO Box 9280 Stn Prov Govt Victoria, BC V8W 9J7

#### Leah Greathead

Tel: (250) 356-8892 Fax: (250) 356-9154

Email: leah.greathead@gov.bc.ca

Counsel for the Intervener, Attorney General of British Columbia

# **GOWLING WLG (CANADA) LLP**

Barristers & Solicitors 160 Elgin Street, Suite 2600 Ottawa, ON K1P 1C3

# D. Lynne Watt

Tel: (613)786-8695 Fax: (613)788-3509

Email: lynne.watt@gowlingwlg.com

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Intervener, Attorney General of Manitoba

# MICHAEL J. SOBKIN

331 Somerset Street West Ottawa, ON K2P 0J8 Tel: (613) 282-1712 Fax: (613) 288-2896

Email: msobkin@sympatico.ca

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Intervener, Attorney General of British Columbia

# ALBERTA JUSTICE AND SOLICITOR GENERAL

Alberta Justice and Solicitor General 10th Floor, 10025 - 102 A Avenue Edmonton, AB T5J 2Z2

# Angela Croteau Nicholas Parker

Tele: (780) 422-6868 Fax: (780) 643-0852

Email: angela.croteau@gov.ab.ca

Counsel for the Intervener, Attorney General of Alberta

# ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE NORTHWEST TERRITORIES

Legal Division, Department of Justice 4903 - 49th Street, P.O. Box 1320 Yellowknife, NWT X1A 2L9

# Trisha Paradis Sandra Jungles

Tel: (867) 767-9257 Fax: (867) 873-0234

Email: Trisha Paradis@gov.nt.ca

Sandra Jungles@gov.nt.ca

Counsel for the Intervener, Attorney General of the Northwest Territories

# JFK LAW CORPORATION

340 - 1122 Mainland Street Vancouver, British Columbia V6B 5L1

# Robert Janes, Q.C. Naomi Moses

Tel: (604) 687-0549 Fax: (604) 687-2696 Email: rjanes@jfklaw.ca

Counsel for the Intervener, Grand Council of

Treaty #3

# GOWLING WLG (CANADA) LLP

Barristers & Solicitors 160 Elgin Street, Suite 2600 Ottawa, ON K1P 1C3

# D. Lynne Watt

Tel: (613)786-8695 Fax: (613)788-3509

Email: lynne.watt@gowlingwlg.com

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Intervener, Attorney General of Alberta

# **GOWLING WLG (CANADA) LLP**

Barristers & Solicitors 160 Elgin Street, Suite 2600 Ottawa, ON K1P 1C3

# D. Lynne Watt

Tel: (613)7886-8695 Fax: (613)788-3509

Email: lynne.watt@gowlingwlg.com

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Intervener, Attorney General of the Northwest Territories

# SUPREME ADVOCACY LLP

100- 340 Gilmour Street Ottawa, ON K2P 0R3

# **Marie-France Major**

Tel: (613) 695-8855 Ext: 102

Fax: (613) 695-8580

Email: mfmajor@supremeadvocacy.ca

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Intervener, Grand Council of Treaty #3

# O'REILLY & ASSOCIÉS

1155 Robert-Bourassa, Suite 1007 Montréal, QC H3B 3A7

James A. O'Reilly, Ad.E. Marie-Claude André-Grégoire Michelle Corbu Vincent Carney

Tel: (514) 871-8117 Fax: (514) 871-9177

Email: james.oreilly@orassocies.ca

Counsel for the Intervener, Innu Takuaikan Uashat Mak Mani-Utenam (ITUM), agissant comme bande traditionnelle et au nom des Innus de Uashat Mak Mani-Utenam

# SUNCHILD LAW

Box 1408 Battleford, SK S0M 0E0

# **Michael Seed**

Tel: (306) 441-1473 Fax: (306) 937-6110

Email: michael@sunchildlaw.com

and

# **DIONNE SCHULZE**

507 Place d'Armes, Suite 502 Montreal, QC H2Y 2W8

#### **David Schulze**

Tel: (514) 842-0748 #228 Email: dschulze@dionneschulze.ca Counsel for the Intervener, Federation of Sovereign Indigenous Nations

# HAFEEZ KHAN LAW CORPORATION

1430-363 Broadway Ave. Winnipeg, MB R3C 3N9

# **Hafeez Khan**

Earl C. Stevenson
Tel: (431) 800-5650
Fax: (431) 800-2702
Email: hkhan@hklawcorp.ca

Counsel for the Intervener, Peguis Child and

Family Services

# BORDEN LADNER GERVAIS LLP

100 Queen Street, suite 1300 Ottawa, ON K1P 1J9

# Nadia Effendi

Tel: (613) 787-3562 Fax: (613) 230-8842 Email: neffendi@blg.com

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Intervener, Federation of Sovereign Indigenous Nations

#### SUPREME ADVOCACY LLP

100- 340 Gilmour Street Ottawa, ON K2P 0R3

# **Marie-France Major**

Tel: (613) 695-8855 Ext: 102 Fax: (613) 695-8580

Email: mfmajor@supremeadvocacy.ca

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the

Intervener, Peguis Child and Family Services

# NATIVE WOMEN'S ASSOCIATION OF CANADA

120 Promenade du Portage Gatineau, QC J8X 2K1

# Sarah Niman Kira Poirier

Tel: (613) 720-2529 Fax: (613) 722-7687 Email: sniman@nwac.ca

Counsel for the Intervener, Native Women's Association of Canada

#### **BOUGHTON LAW CORPORATION**

700-595 Burrard Street Vancouver, BC V7X 1S8

# Tammy Shoranick Daryn Leas James M. Coady

Tel: (604) 687-6789 Fax: (604) 683-5317

Email: tshoranick@boughtonlaw.com

Counsel for the Intervener, Council of Yukon

First Nations

# **GOWLING WLG (CANADA) LLP**

Suite 2300, Bentall 5 550 Burrard Street Vancouver, BC V6C 2B5

# Paul Seaman Keith Brown

Tel: (604) 891-2731 / (416) 862-3614

Fax: (604) 443-6780

Email: paul.seaman@gowlingwlg.com |

Counsel for the Intervener, Indigenous Bar Association

# FIRST PEOPLES LAW LLP

55 Murray Street, Suite 230 Ottawa, ON K1N 5M3

# Virginia Lomax

Tel: (613) 722-9091

Email: <u>vlomax@firstpeopleslaw.com</u>

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Intervener, Native Women's Association of Canada

#### BORDEN LADNER GERVAIS LLP

100 Queen Street, suite 1300 Ottawa, ON K1P 1J9

#### Nadia Effendi

Tel: (613) 787-3562 Fax: (613) 230-8842 Email: neffendi@blg.com

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Intervener, Council of Yukon First Nations

# GOWLING WLG (CANADA) LLP

Suite 2600 160 Elgin Street Ottawa, ON K1P 1C3

#### **Cam Cameron**

Tel: (613) 786-8650 Fax: (613) 563-9869

Email: <a href="mailto:cam.cameron@gowlingwlg.com">cam.cameron@gowlingwlg.com</a>

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Intervener, Indigenous Bar Association

# **OLTHUIS, KLEER, TOWNSHEND LLP**

250 University Ave., 8th floor Toronto, ON M5H 2E5

Maggie Wente Krista Nerland

Tel: (416) 981-9330 Fax: (416) 981-9350

Email: <u>mwente@oktlaw.com</u>

Counsel for the Intervener, Chiefs of Ontario

FOLGER, RUBINOFF LLP

77 King Street West; Suite 3000, Toronto, ON M5K 1G8

**Katherine Hensel Kristie Tsang** 

Tel: (416) 864-7608 Fax: (416) 941-8852

Email: khensel@foglers.com

Counsel for the Intervener, Inuvialuit Regional

Corporation

**GOWLING WLG (CANADA) LLP** 

2600 – 160 Elgin Street Ottawa, ON, K1P 1C3

Brian A. Crane, Q.C. Graham Ragan Alyssa Flaherty-Spence Kate Darling

Tel: (613) 786-0107 Fax: (613) 563-9869

Email: Brian.crane@gowlingwlg.com

Counsel for the Interveners, Inuit Tapiriit Kanatami, Nunatsiavut Government And

Nunavut Tunngavik Incorporated

SUPREME ADVOCACY LLP

100- 340 Gilmour Street Ottawa, ON K2P 0R3

**Marie-France Major** 

Tel: (613) 695-8855 Ext: 102

Fax: (613) 695-8580

Email: mfmajor@supremeadvocacy.ca

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Intervener, Chiefs of Ontario

SUPREME ADVOCACY LLP

100- 340 Gilmour Street Ottawa, ON K2P 0R3

**Marie-France Major** 

Tel: (613) 695-8855 Ext: 102

Fax: (613) 695-8580

Email: mfmajor@supremeadvocacy.ca

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Intervener, Inuvialuit Regional Corporation

# **BURCHELLS LLP**

1800-1801 Hollis St. Halifax, NS B3J 3N4

#### **Jason Cooke**

# **Ashley Hamp-Gonsalves**

Tel: (902) 422-5374 Fax: (902) 420-9326 Email: jcooke@burchells.ca

Counsel for the Intervener, Nuntukavut

**Community Council** 

# WILLIAM B. HENDERSON

3014 - 88 Bloor St East Toronto, ON M4W 3G9

Tel: (416) 413-9878

Email: <u>lawyer@bloorstreet.com</u>

Counsel for the Intervener, Lands Advisory

Board

# PAPE SALTER TEILLET LLP

546 Euclid Avenue Toronto, Ontario, M6G 2T2

# Jason T. Madden Alexander DeParde

Tel.: (416) 916-3853 Fax: (416) 916-3726 Email: imadden@pstlaw.ca

-and-

# CASSELS BROCK & BLACKWELL LLP

885 West Georgia Street, Suite 2200

Vancouver, BC, V6C 3E8

# Emilie N. Lahaie

Tel.: (778) 372-7651 Fax: (604) 691-6120 Email: <u>elahaie@cassels.com</u>

Counsel for Interveners, Métis National Council, Métis Nation-Saskatchewan, Métis Nation of Alberta, Métis Nation British Columbia, Métis Nation of Ontario and Les femmes Michif Otipemisiwak

#### **POWER LAW**

99 Bank Street Suite 701 Ottawa, ON K1P 6B9

# Jonathan Laxer

Tel: (613) 907-5652 Fax: (613) 907-5652 Email: jlaxer@powerlaw.ca

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Intervener, Nuntukavut Community Council

# SUPREME ADVOCACY LLP

100- 340 Gilmour Street Ottawa, ON K2P 0R3

# **Marie-France Major**

Tel: (613) 695-8855 Ext: 102

Fax: (613) 695-8580

Email: mfmajor@supremeadvocacy.ca

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Intervener, Lands Advisory Board

# GOWLING WLG (CANADA) LLP

160 Elgin Street Suite 2600 Ottawa K1P 1C3

# **Matthew Estabrooks**

Tel.: (613) 786-0211 Fax: (613) 788-3573

Email: matthew.estabrooks@gowlingwlg.com

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Intervener, Métis National Council, Métis Nation-Saskatchewan, Métis Nation of Alberta, Métis Nation British Columbia, Métis Nation of Ontario and Les femmes Michif Otipemisiwak

#### PAPE SALTER TEILLET LLP

546 Euclid Avenue Toronto, Ontario, M6G 2T2

# Zachary Davis Riley Weyman

Tel.: (416) 427-0337 Fax: (416) 916-3726 Email: zdavis@pstlaw.ca

Counsel for the Intervener, Listuguj Mi'Gmaq

Government

# PALIARE, ROLAND, ROSENBERG, ROTHSTEIN, LLP

155 Wellington Street West, 35th Floor Toronto, ON M5V 3H1

# Andrew K. Lokan

Tel: (416) 646-4324 Fax: (416) 646-4301

Email: andrew.lokan@paliareroland.com

Counsel for the Intervener, Congress

of Aboriginal Peoples

# PUBLIC INTEREST LAW CENTRE

100 - 287 Broadway Winnipeg, MB R3C 0R9

Joëlle Pastora Sala Allison Fenske Maximilian Griffin-Rill

**Adrienne Cooper** 

Tel: (204) 985-9735 Fax: (204) 985-8544 Email: jopas@pilc.mb.ca

Counsel for the Intervener, First Nations

Family Advocate Office

# GOWLING WLG (CANADA) LLP

160 Elgin Street Suite 2600 Ottawa K1P 1C3

# **Matthew Estabrooks**

Tel.: (613) 786-0211 Fax: (613) 788-3573

Email: matthew.estabrooks@gowlingwlg.com

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the

Intervener, Listuguj Mi'Gmaq Government

# DENTONS CANADA LLP

99 Bank Street, Suite 1420 Ottawa, ON K1P 1H4

#### David R. Elliott

Tel: (613) 783-9699 Fax: (613) 783-9690

Email: david.elliott@dentons.com

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Intervener, Congress of Aboriginal Peoples

# **JURISTES POWER**

99, rue Bank, Bureau 701 Ottawa, ON K1P 6B9

# **Darius Bossé**

Tel: (613) 702-5566 Fax: (613) 702-5566

Email: <u>DBosse@juristespower.ca</u>

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Intervener, First Nations Family Advocate

Office

#### **TORYS LLP**

79 Wellington Street, 30th Floor Box 270, TD Centre Toronto, ON M5K 1N2

David Outerbridge Craig Gilchrist Rebecca Amoah

Tel: (416) 865-7825 Fax (416) 865-7380

Email: douterbridge@torys.com

Counsel for the Intervener, Assembly of Manitoba Chiefs

FIRST NATIONS OF THE MAA-NULTH TREATY SOCIETY

500-221 West Esplanade North Vancouver, BC V7M 3J3

Maegen M. Giltrow, K.C. Natalia Sudeyko

Tel: (604) 988-5201 Fax: (604) 988-1452

Email: mgiltrow@ratcliff.com

Counsel for the Intervener, First Nations of the

Maa-Nuth Treaty Society

GOWLING WLG (CANADA) LLP

Suite 2300, Bentall 5 550 Burrard Street Vancouver, BC V6C 2B5

**Aaron Christoff Brent Murphy** 

Tel: (604) 443-7685 Fax: (604) 683-3558

Email: aaron.christoff@gowlingwlg.com

Counsel for the Intervener, Tribal Chiefs

Ventures Inc.

**CHAMP & ASSOCIATES** 

43 Florence Street Ottawa, ON K2P 0W6

**Bijon Roy** 

Tel: (613) 237-4740 Fax: (613) 232-2680 Email: broy@champlaw.ca

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Intervener, First Nations of the Maa-Nuth Treaty Society

**GOWLING WLG (CANADA) LLP** 

160 Elgin Street Suite 2600 Ottawa K1P 1C3

**Marie-Christine Gagnon** 

Tel.: (613) 786-0086 Fax: (613) 7563-9869

Email:

Marie-hristine.Gagnon@ca.gowlingwlg.com

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Intervener, Tribal Chiefs Ventures Inc.

# **OLTHUIS VAN ERT**

66 Lisgar Street Ottawa, ON K2P 0C1

Gib van Ert Fraser Harland Mary Ellen Turpel-Lafond

Tel: (613) 408-4297 Fax: (613) 651-0304

Email: gvanert@ovcounsel.com

Counsel for the Intervener, Union of British Columbia Indian Chiefs, First Nations Summit of British Columbia and British Columbia Assembly of First Nations

# GOLDBLATT PARTNERS LLP

20 Dundas Street West, Suite 1100 Toronto, ON M5G 2G8

# Jessica Orkin Natai Shelsen

Tel: (416) 977-6070 Fax: (416) 591-7333

Email: jorkin@goldblattpartners.com

Counsel for the Intervener, David Asper Centre

for Constitutional Rights

# **CAIN LAMARRE**

814, boul. Saint Joseph Roberval, QC G8H 2L5

# François G. Tremblay Benoît Amyot

Tel: (418) 545-4580 Fax: (418) 549-9590

Email: notification.cain.saguenay@clcw.ca

Counsel for the Intervener, Regroupement

Petapan

# GOLDBLATT PARTNERS LLP

500-30 Metcalfe St. Ottawa, ON K1P 5L4

# Colleen Bauman

Tel: (613) 482-2463 Fax: (613) 235-5327

Email: cbauman@goldblattpartners.com

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Intervener, David Asper Centre for Constitutional Rights

# CONWAY BAXTER WILSON LLP

400 - 411 Roosevelt Avenue Ottawa, ON K2A 3X9

#### **Marion Sandilands**

Tel: (613) 288-0149 Fax: (613) 688-0271

Email: msandilands@conway.pro

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Intervener, Regroupement Petapan

# MCCARTHY, TÉTRAULT LLP

TD Bank Tower Suite 5300 Toronto, ON M5K 1E6

# Jesse Hartery Simon Bouthillier

Tel: (416) 362-1812 Fax: (416) 868-0673

Email: jhartery@mccarthy.ca

Counsel for the Intervener, Canadian Constitution Foundation

# GOWLING WLG (CANADA) LLP

Suite 2300, Bentall 5 550 Burrard Street Vancouver, BC V6C 2B5

# Scott A. Smith

Tel: (604) 891-2764 Fax: (604) 443-6784

Email: aaron.christoff@gowlingwlg.com

Counsel for the Intervener, Carrier Sekani Family Services Society, Cheslatta Carrier Nation, Nadleh Whuten, Saik'uz First Nation and Stellat'en First Nation

#### SIMARD BOIVIN LEMIEUX

1150, boul. Saint-Félicien Bureau 106 Saint-Félicien, QC G8K 2W5

# **Kevin Ajmo**

Tel: (418) 679-8888 Fax: (514) 679-8902

Email: k.ajmo@sblavocats.com

Counsel for the Intervener, Conseil des Atikamekw d'Opitciwan

# GOWLING WLG (CANADA) LLP

160 Elgin Street Suite 2600 Ottawa K1P 1C3

# Jeffrey W. Beedell

Tel.: (613) 786-0171 Fax: (613) 563-9869

Email: jeff.beedell@gowlingwlg.com

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Intervener, Carrier Sekani Family Services Society, Cheslatta Carrier Nation, Nadleh Whuten, Saik'uz First Nation and Stellat'en First Nation

# **GOWLING WLG (CANADA) LLP**

Suite 2300, Bentall 5 550 Burrard Street Vancouver, BC V6C 2B5

# **Maxime Faille**

Tel: (604) 891-2733 Fax: (604) 443-6784

Email: maxime.faille@gowlingwlg.com

Counsel for the Intervener, Vancouver Aboriginal Child & Family Services Society

# **FALCONERS LLP**

10 Alcorn Avenue, Suite 204 Toronto, ON M4V 3A9

#### Julian N. Falconer

Tel: (416) 964-0495 Ext: 222

Fax: (416) 929-8179 Email: julianf@falconers.ca

Counsel for the Intervener, Nishnawbe Aski

Nation

# **GOWLING WLG (CANADA) LLP**

160 Elgin Street Suite 2600 Ottawa K1P 1C3

# Jeffrey W. Beedell

Tel.: (613) 786-0171 Fax: (613) 563-9869

Email: jeff.beedell@gowlingwlg.com

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Intervener, Vancouver Aboriginal Child & Family Services Society

# SUPREME ADVOCACY LLP

100- 340 Gilmour Street Ottawa, ON K2P 0R3

# **Marie-France Major**

Tel: (613) 695-8855 Ext: 102

Fax: (613) 695-8580

Email: mfmajor@supremeadvocacy.ca

Ottawa Agent for Counsel for the Intervener, Nishnawbe Aski Nation

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

PART I – OVERVIEW OF POSITION AND FACTS
A. Overview
B. Facts
PART II – POSITION ON QUESTIONS RAISED2
PART III – STATEMENT OF ARGUMENT
A. Treaty 6 supports an inherent Indigenous right of self-government, including with respect to child and family services, and has not been abrogated
B. The honour of the Crown requires a cooperative approach for recognizing and implementing the inherent Indigenous right of self-government in regards to child and family services
PART IV – COSTS
PART V – TABLE OF AUTHORITIES11

# PART I—OVERVIEW OF POSITION AND FACTS

# A. Overview

- 1. Tribal Chiefs Ventures Inc. ("TCVI") is a tribal council of Treaty 6 Nations, mandated to advance the treaty and inherent rights of its member Nations. In this regard, TCVI makes two submissions to the Court on the vital issues at play concerning the implementation of an inherent Indigenous right of self-government in the context of the legislation at issue, *An Act respecting First Nations, Inuit and Métis children, youth and families* (S.C. 2019, c. 24) (the "Act"). This inherent right of self-government flows from the broader right of self-determination that has been inherited from the Creator.
- 2. First, Treaty 6 is a solemn Nation to Nation arrangement that supports the recognition of an inherent Indigenous right of self-government, including with respect to jurisdiction over child and family services. Neither the inherent right at issue, nor the Crown-Indigenous relationship under Treaty 6, have been overtaken by any later developments, including the creation of the Provinces, or the 1930 provincial Natural Resource Transfer Agreements ("NRTAs"). Further, since 1982, these inherent rights have been recognized and affirmed under the Canadian constitution pursuant to s. 35 of the *Constitution Act, 1982*. Recognition of an inherent Indigenous right of self-government in the context of children and families is also consistent with, and further affirmed by, the *United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples* ("UNDRIP"), which has now been adopted without qualification by Canada. The legal effect of Canada, the original treaty partner, deciding to recognize and implement an Indigenous right of self-government through the Act is that Indigenous laws passed under that legislation must trump provincial jurisdiction in instances where the two conflict.
- 3. Second, the unwritten principle of the honour of the Crown requires the federal and provincial Crowns to work together to recognize, enhance, uphold and implement that inherent right, and accordingly, to implement and operationalize the Act. Further, the pre-existing territorial boundaries associated with Treaty 6 give rise to an obligation to cooperate across the Crown's internal division of powers, and across provincial boundaries where necessary.

# B. Facts

4. TCVI takes no position regarding the facts as set out in the parties' facta, but adds the following:

- 5. TCVI is a federally incorporated not-for-profit organization and a federally recognized Tribal Council of Treaty 6 Nations. TCVI's member Nations include Beaver Lake Cree Nation, Cold Lake First Nations, Frog Lake First Nations, Heart Lake First Nation, Kehewin Cree Nation, and Whitefish Lake First Nation No. 128, all adherents to Treaty 6.
- 6. Treaty 6 was entered into in 1876 between First Nations and the federal Crown, pre-dating the creation of Alberta and Saskatchewan as provinces in 1905. Treaty 6 includes 48 First Nations (17 AB, 29 SK, & 2 MB). The relevant territory stretches from western Alberta into Saskatchewan and Manitoba. Among other things, Treaty 6 includes special clauses for "medicine chest", education rights, and famine and pestilence.<sup>2</sup>
- 7. The overrepresentation of Indigenous children in care is well-known, and dire.<sup>3</sup> This is particularly so in Alberta, where in 2014/2015 it was determined that Indigenous children account for 69% of the children in care despite comprising only 9% of the population.<sup>4</sup> Alberta's Office of the Child and Youth Advocate has confirmed as recently as September 2022 that Indigenous children continue to be overrepresented in care, and in deaths in the child welfare system (making up approximately 80% of those deaths from October 2021 to March 2022).<sup>5</sup> For this reason, jurisdiction over child and family services is a matter of critical importance; quite literally a matter of life or death for TCVI's member Nations and their children.

# PART II—POSITION ON QUESTIONS RAISED

8. TCVI provides two submissions to assist the Court in resolving this appeal: (i) Treaty 6 supports the existence of an inherent Indigenous right of self-government, including with respect to child and family services. This inherent Indigenous right has not been overtaken by later developments,

<sup>2</sup> <u>Treaty No 6 between Her Majesty the Queen and the Plain and Wood Cree Indians and other Tribes of Indians at Fort Carlton, Fort Pitt and Battle River with Adhesions ("Treaty 6").</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Frank v R, [1978] 1 SCR 95 ("Frank") at paras 3, 5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Renvoi à la Cour d'appel du Québec relatif à la Loi concernant les enfants, les jeunes et les familles des Premières Nations, des Inuits et des Métis, <u>2022 QCCA 185</u> ("QCCA Opinion") at paras 126-136.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Record of the First Nations Child and Family Caring Society of Canada, vol 10, Exhibit CB-29 of Sworn Declaration of Dr. Cindy Blackstock, December 4, 2020, "Aboriginal Children in Care: Report to Canada's Premiers July 2015" at pp 2624 and 2647.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> <u>Mandatory Reviews into Child Deaths, October 1, 2021-March 31, 2022</u>, Office of the Child and Youth Advocate Alberta, September 2022.

but instead has been affirmed by s. 35 of the *Constitution Act, 1982* and UNDRIP; and (ii) the unwritten constitutional principle of the honour of the Crown requires both of the federal and provincial Crowns to work together to uphold Treaty, including inherent self-government rights, and to implement and operationalize validly enacted legislation for the benefit of First Nations, which includes cross-border cooperation.

9. Given the above, TCVI submits that (i) the Court below correctly recognized that an inherent Indigenous right of self-government exists with respect to jurisdiction over children and families, consistent with Treaty 6 and is protected by s. 35 of the *Constitution Act, 1982*; and (ii) ss. 18, 20(2), 20(3), 21(1), and 22(3) of the Act are valid mechanisms by which the inherent right of self-government may be operationalized. The overarching principle of the honour of the Crown requires that the different orders of government cooperate in good faith to implement the Act.

# PART III—STATEMENT OF ARGUMENT

- A. Treaty 6 supports an inherent Indigenous right of self-government, including with respect to child and family services, and has not been abrogated
- 10. Treaties form part of Canada's constitutional architecture and in this regard, inform the progressive interpretive exercise required by this case. As recognized by the Court below:

Aboriginal peoples have a right of self-government within Canada, <u>based on the historical relationship between them and the Crown</u>, such right forming part of the Aboriginal rights recognized and affirmed by s. 35 of the *Constitution Act, 1982...* [this right exists] within the contemporary Canadian constitutional architecture, at least with respect to child and family services, and it is constitutionally protected under s. 35 [emphasis added].<sup>6</sup>

11. TCVI submits that Treaty 6, and the superimposition of borders in that territory by Canada over time, does not undermine the existence of an inherent right of self-government, nor justify an analysis which would prefer provincial jurisdiction to Indigenous jurisdiction over their own children and families in any way relevant to this appeal or the Act. To the contrary, TCVI submits that Treaty 6 affirms the existence of an inherent right of self-government, including jurisdiction over children and families, for Treaty 6 nations.

.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> QCCA Opinion at para 364.

- 12. Firstly, Treaty 6, as with all documents of a constitutional character, demands a progressive interpretation. Such treaties should be "liberally construed", 7 and their interpretation should be capable of evolution within their natural limits to ensure their continued relevance and legitimacy in modern times. 8 Treaties "are solemn agreements and they are intended to last indefinitely." 9
- 13. In this specific regard, Treaty 6 does not expressly speak to a right of self-government *per se* (nor indeed care of children and families). However, TCVI submits that the existence of this inherent right ought to be presumed in view of the solemn relationship arrived at as between nations, enshrined by the treaty, and now further supported by the articles of UNDRIP. Treaty 6 is premised on a recognition of the collective status and political leadership of the First Nation signatories (indeed, without which it would have been impossible to conclude it). As stated by this Court in *R v. Badger*:

... it must be remembered that a treaty represents an exchange of solemn promises between the Crown and the various Indian nations. It is an agreement whose nature is sacred.<sup>10</sup>

- 14. The treaty relationship also assumes the basic independence of the signatories, and includes an agreement for all to live together peaceably (and TCVI would add, largely independently). In this respect, the underlying principle and terms of Treaty 6 are consistent with, and are premised upon, the implicit recognition of the inherent right of self-government which must be reconciled with the assertion of Crown sovereignty and the underlying agreement to share the land.<sup>11</sup>
- 15. This relationship is founded upon the *Royal Proclamation of 1763*, which established the core elements of the relationship between First Nations and the Crown, recognizing First Nation rights in Canada, and implementing the treaty-making process. As discussed by this Court in *Manitoba Métis Federation v. Canada*, this relationship was premised on a recognition of Indigenous strength and independence, rather than a paternalistic desire to protect or subjugate Indigenous peoples.<sup>12</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> R v Marshall, [1999] 3 SCR 456 at para 78(2).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Reference re Same-Sex Marriage, 2004 SCC 79 at para 23.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Keewatin v Ontario (Natural Resources), 2013 ONCA 158 at para 137.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> R v Badger, [1996] 1 SCR 771 at para 41.

<sup>11</sup> Treaty 6

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Manitoba Métis Federation v Canada (Attorney-General), 2013 SCC 14 ("MMF") at para 66.

- 16. Treaty 6 has been specifically described by the Federal Court as "an instrument of peace and friendship, in that it forged an alliance between the aboriginal people of that area with the Canadian government." This Court has found that one central purpose of Treaty 6 was to preserve the "traditional Indian way of life." <sup>14</sup>
- 17. In its factum, the Attorney General of Alberta seeks to persuade this Court that "cede and surrender" clauses in treaties could somehow operate to extinguish the inherent right of self-government. This position is untenable, and an issue that this Court ought not entertain for one instant. There is no support for the proposition that this "cede and surrender" language has any application beyond issues relating to Indigenous peoples agreeing to share their lands and resources with newcomers, and indeed the text of Treaty 6 refers only to land. 16
- 18. Importantly, the creation of Alberta and Saskatchewan in 1905 also has no bearing on the care of children and families. As noted above, Treaty 6 was signed in 1876 and pre-dated their creation. Though provincial boundaries were later unilaterally superimposed, it did not alter the treaty relationship, the assumptions underpinning the relationship, nor the essential terms of the treaty as it was concluded with the federal Crown. This Court recently held that the subsequent imposition of provincial and even international borders does not preclude the assertion of s. 35 rights, nor obviate the Crown's obligation to deal with Indigenous people to reconcile those rights.

<sup>13</sup> Buffalo v Canada, 2005 FC 1622 at para 514.

<sup>15</sup> Factum of the Intervener, Attorney General of Alberta ("AB Factum") at paras 22-23.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> R v Sundown, [1999] 1 SCR 393 at para 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Treaty 6 provides: "The Plain and Wood Cree Tribes of Indians, and all other the Indians inhabiting the district hereinafter described and defined, do hereby cede, release, surrender and yield up...all their rights, titles and privileges, whatsoever, to the lands included within the following limits..." [emphasis added].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> See *Frank* at para 5, where this Court determined that the creation of Alberta and Saskatchewan in 1905 did not affect "[t]he right of Indians to hunt on Treaty No. 6 lands…"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> See e.g. Newfoundland and Labrador (Attorney General) v Uashaunnuat (Innu of Uashat and of Mani-Utenam), <u>2020 SCC 4</u> at para 49; R v Desautel, <u>2021 SCC 17</u> ("Desautel"); R v Boyer, <u>2022 SKCA 62</u> at para 116.

- 19. Likewise, it is clear that the NRTAs did not fragment treaty areas by provincial boundaries in any way relevant to this appeal. 19 The Attorney General of Alberta's invocation of the NRTAs in its factum is plainly a red herring: these agreements were arrangements internal to the Crown, and have no bearing on inherent rights relating to Indigenous people caring for their own children and families. As this Court recently reaffirmed in *R. v. Desautel*, "the NRTAs ... are 'constitutional agreement[s], not the Constitution'." 20
- 20. Today, the inherent rights at issue are recognized and affirmed by s. 35 of the *Constitution Act,* 1982, and further affirmed by the articles of UNDRIP, which has now been adopted without qualification by Canada via the *United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples Act*, S.C. 2021, c. 14 ("UNDRIPA").
- 21. Alberta courts have already begun to recognize the applicability of UNDRIPA in the context of child protection, noting that "the rights guaranteed by international convention are given express application to Canadian law",<sup>21</sup> and that "Article 8 ... and other articles of the UNDRIPA are relevant and have application to the child protection schemes in Canada and are particularly relevant to private guardianship applications because of the risks of assimilation inherent in the adoption of Indigenous children, particularly by non-Indigenous persons."<sup>22</sup>
- 22. UNDRIP, of course, contains provisions affirming the rights of Indigenous peoples and requires that states such as Canada honour and respect treaties made with them,<sup>23</sup> and recognize Indigenous peoples' right to govern themselves<sup>24</sup> and care for and bring up their children in their culture.<sup>25</sup>
- 23. The inherent rights at issue clearly mirror a basic human right to care for one's own children and families. The Act provides a procedural method to implement this right. This is not a situation,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> *Frank* at para 12; *R v Green*, 2022 SKCA 92 at paras 34, 41.

Desautel, at para 42, citing Daniels v Canada (Indian Affairs and Northern Development), 2016 SCC
 at para 44.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> MM v Alberta (Child, Youth and Family Enhancement Act, Director), 2021 ABPC 317 at para 29.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> SK v Alberta (Child, Youth and Family Enhancement Act, Director), <u>2022 ABPC 144</u> at para 23.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples ("UNDRIP") at Article 37.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> UNDRIP at Articles 3 and 4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> UNDRIP at Articles  $\frac{7}{2}$  and  $\frac{14}{2}$ .

as suggested by Alberta, where it is appropriate for Indigenous people to be put to strict proof of their right to care for their own children and families. As stated by the Court below:

This right of self-government [child and family services] falls within s. 35 because it is a form of Aboriginal right. It is a generic right that extends to all Aboriginal peoples, because it is intimately tied to their cultural continuity and survival. In the past, significant barriers, such as residential schools, impeded the exercise of that right. These situations, however, were never endorsed by Parliament, which never indicated, through clear and unambiguous legislation, its intention to extinguish the right.<sup>26</sup>

- 24. Furthermore, jurisdiction over care of one's own children and families carries with it the inevitable consequence that provincial jurisdiction must be fully ousted whenever necessary. The Attorney General of Alberta complains of various matters regarding the Louis Bull Tribe's AMO Law which, among other things, claims jurisdiction with respect to its children off-reserve and ousts the jurisdiction of provincial courts over its children.<sup>27</sup> However, these features are essential and indeed the very point of exercising jurisdiction over the care of children and families. In any event, it is not necessary for this Court to opine on the breadth or validity of any particular community's laws to resolve this case.<sup>28</sup>
- 25. The inappropriateness of subjecting a right of self-government regarding children and families to the *Sparrow* test is addressed in the submissions of other interveners and the parties. From a treaty perspective, though, it bears emphasizing that this Court has found that the provinces cannot extinguish s. 35 rights.<sup>29</sup> Thus, provinces cannot now say that provincial jurisdiction trumps treaty and inherent rights, leaving the original treaty partner, Canada, constitutionally impotent if the provinces simply choose not to cooperate. As set out below, this state of affairs also would not accord with the honour of the Crown.
- 26. In the present case, this means that the treaty relationship, and the underlying affirmation of the right of self-government among treaty nations, subsists and is now recognized and affirmed by s.

<sup>28</sup> See *Phillips v Nova Scotia (Commission of Inquiry into the Westray Mine Tragedy)*, [1995] 2 SCR 97 at paras 6-11.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> OCCA Opinion at para 59.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> AB Factum at para 20.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Delgamuukw v British Columbia, [1997] 3 SCR 1010 ("Delgamuukw") at paras 180-183.

35 of the *Constitution Act 1982*, and should not be subordinated by provincial jurisdiction, including through the application of an analysis focused on justification of infringement.

- B. The honour of the Crown requires a cooperative approach for recognizing and implementing the inherent Indigenous right of self-government in regards to child and family services
- 27. This Court has previously held that unwritten constitutional principles may in certain circumstances give rise to substantive legal obligations capable of limiting government action. Such unwritten constitutional principles are "not merely descriptive, but are also invested with a powerful normative force, and are binding on both courts and governments."<sup>30</sup>
- 28. TCVI submits that the honour of the Crown, as an unwritten constitutional principle,<sup>31</sup> requires that Canada and the provinces cooperate with Indigenous communities to recognize and implement the inherent Indigenous jurisdiction over child and family services under the Act. This was recognized by the Court below when it held that "[c]ooperation between the federal and provincial governments in recognizing and implementing Aboriginal rights is necessary to ensure the harmonious exercise of these rights. This cooperation flows from the constitutional principle of the honour of the Crown..."<sup>32</sup>
  - 29. In this case, the legal obligations that flow from the honour of the Crown must be understood to apply to both the federal and provincial governments. This is particularly so in the treaty context, where obligations are owed by both levels of government and where the exercise of Crown powers—both federal and provincial—are burdened by those treaty obligations.<sup>33</sup> As set out above, the provinces have no constitutional authority to extinguish s. 35 rights;<sup>34</sup> to allow the provinces to defeat the recognition and implementation of s. 35 rights by simply refusing to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Reference re Secession of Quebec, [1998] 2 SCR 217 at para 54; See also Toronto (City) v Ontario (Attorney General), 2021 SCC 34 ("Toronto (City)") at paras 54-56.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Beckman v Little Salmon/Carmacks First Nation, 2010 SCC 53 at para 42; Toronto (City) at paras 54-56.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> OCCA Opinion at para 559.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Grassy Narrows First Nation v Ontario (Minister of Natural Resources), 2014 SCC 48 ("Grassy Narrows") at paras 35, 50.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> <u>Delgamuukw</u> at paras 180-183.

cooperate would be to "[permit] the Crown to do by one means that which it cannot do by another [and] would undermine the endeavour of reconciliation, which animates Aboriginal law."<sup>35</sup>

- 30. That the Act was passed by the federal government—the original Treaty 6 partner—does not detract from a provincial responsibility to honour the Act's purpose. To the contrary, as discussed above, Treaty 6 does not include any clear and plain intent to extinguish the inherent Indigenous authority over children and families. As such, both the federal and provincial governments share the burden of recognizing and implementing this existing inherent Indigenous authority, via the Act. This is in line with ultimate purpose of the honour of the Crown, which is the reconciliation of pre-existing Aboriginal societies with the assertion of Crown sovereignty.<sup>36</sup>
- 31. The honour of the Crown, and the resultant Crown obligations to recognize and implement the exercise of inherent Indigenous authority over child and family services through the unique context of this Act, also accords with the principle of cooperative federalism by facilitating and indeed requiring the "enactment of co-ordinated federal and provincial legislative schemes to better deal with the local needs of unity and diversity."<sup>37</sup>
- 32. Further, because the territorial boundaries established by treaty differ from the provincial boundaries that were established at a later date, there is both a legal and practical need for cooperation with respect to recognizing and implementing Indigenous self-government rights, both within the individual provinces and in some instances, across provincial boundaries.
- 33. One consequence of the unilateral imposition of borders in Treaty 6 territory is that certain Indigenous communities in Treaty 6 find themselves bisected by these provincial borders. This means that in some instances, Treaty 6 communities may have two separate provincial child and family services regimes applied to their children and families. Thus, in the context of Treaty 6, the objective of reconciliation and the concomitant obligations associated with the honour of the Crown may require that the federal government, Alberta, and Saskatchewan cooperate alongside Indigenous peoples when implementing the inherent Indigenous jurisdiction over children and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Mikisew Cree First Nation v Canada (Governor General in Council), 2018 SCC 40 at para 44.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> *MMF* at para 66.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Quebec (Attorney General) v Canada (Attorney General), <u>2015 SCC 14</u> at para 148.

families. This is part and parcel of the treaty relationship, and the provinces being subject to both the benefits and burdens of the treaty relationship originally established by Canada.<sup>38</sup>

34. In the context of Treaty 6, a multi-jurisdictional and cooperative approach to recognizing and implementing inherent Indigenous jurisdiction over children and families also accords with the honourable requirement to act diligently in the pursuit of the Crown's solemn obligations and the honourable reconciliation of Crown and Aboriginal interests.<sup>39</sup> This cooperation between and among the federal and provincial governments is essential to achieving these objectives, and only in realizing these objectives can the treaty relationship be honoured, the purposes of the Act be fulfilled, and the integrity of Indigenous children, families, and communities be safeguarded.

# PART IV—COSTS

35. TCVI does not seek costs and respectfully asks that no costs be awarded against it.

# ALL OF WHICH IS RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED

Dated at Vancouver, British Columbia, November 14, 2022.

Aaron Christoff & Brent Murphy
Counsel for the Intervener, Tribal Chiefs
Ventures Inc.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> *Grassy Narrows* at para 50.

 $<sup>\</sup>frac{39}{\text{See } \underline{MMF}}$  at para 78.

# PART V—TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Legislation and Regulations	Paragraph References
Constitution Act, 1982	2, 8, 9, 20, 26
United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples Act, S.C. 2021, c. 14	20, 21
<u>United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples</u>	22
<u>Treaty No 6</u> between Her Majesty the Queen and the Plain and Wood Cree Indians and other Tribes of Indians at Fort Carlton, Fort Pitt and Battle River with Adhesions	6, 14, 17
Case Law	Paragraph References
Beckman v Little Salmon/Carmacks First Nation, 2010 SCC 53	28
Buffalo v Canada, 2005 FC 1622	16
Daniels v Canada (Indian Affairs and Northern Development), 2016 SCC 12	19
Delgamuukw v British Columbia, [1997] 3 SCR 1010	25, 29
Frank v R, [1978] 1 SCR 95	6, 18, 19
Grassy Narrows First Nation v Ontario (Minister of Natural Resources), 2014 SCC 48	29, 33
Keewatin v Ontario (Natural Resources), 2013 ONCA 158	12
Manitoba Métis Federation v Canada, 2013 SCC 14	15, 30, 34
MM v Alberta (Child, Youth and Family Enhancement Act, Director), 2021 ABPC 317	21
Mikisew Cree First Nation v. Canada (Governor General in Council), 2018 SCC 4	29

Newfoundland and Labrador (Attorney General) v Uashaunnuat (Innu of Uashat and of Mani-Utenam), 2020 SCC 4	18
Phillips v Nova Scotia (Commission of Inquiry into the Westray Mine Tragedy), [1995] 2 SCR 97	24
Quebec (Attorney General) v Canada (Attorney General), <u>2015 SCC</u> <u>14</u>	31
R. v. Badger, [1996] 1 SCR 771	13
R. v Desautel, 2021 SCC 17	18, 19
R v Boyer, <u>2022 SKCA 62</u>	18
R v Green, 2022 SKCA 92	19
R v Marshall, [1999] 3 SCR 456	12
R v Sundown, [1999] 1 SCR 393	16
Reference re Secession of Quebec, [1998] 2 SCR 217	27
Reference re Same-Sex Marriage, 2004 SCC 79	12
Renvoi à la Cour d'appel du Québec relatif à la Loi concernant les enfants, les jeunes et les familles des Premières Nations, des Inuits et des Métis, <u>2022 QCCA 185</u>	7, 10, 23, 28
SK v Alberta (Child, Youth and Family Enhancement Act, Director), 2022 ABPC 144	21
Toronto (City) v Ontario (Attorney General), <u>2021 SCC 34</u>	27, 28
Secondary Sources	Paragraph References
Mandatory Reviews into Child Deaths, October 1, 2021-March 31, 2022, Office of the Child and Youth Advocate Alberta, September 2022	7